LEGGITIMACY OF HADITH AMAR MAKRUF NAHI MUNKAR AS EVIDENCE OF VIOLENCE BY FPI

Idham Hamid¹
Neny Muthi’atul Awwaliyah²

¹UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Jogjakarta, idhamhamid56@gmail.com
²UIN Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Jogjakarta, nenyulthia@gmail.com

Abstract. This paper explains the concept that was initiated by the Islamic Defenders Front (FPI) mass organization in applying amar makruf nahi munkar. The concept is based on the Prophet's hadith, which was narrated from Abu Said al-Khudri about the steps taken when looking at the munkar that occurred in the community. The facts on the ground show that, the steps taken by FPI when eradicating the impression are only following the first editorial on the hadith, namely preventing it with a 'hand' which is often interpreted as an act of violence. So it is not uncommon when conducting executions in the field often causes conflicts that trigger hostilities to the point of conflict with criminal law. This is the result of textual understanding and partial impression in understanding the hadith amar makruf nahi munkar. The offer to understand the verses contextually and review aspects of their maqasyid is a necessity when they want to apply them to the social spaces of Indonesia that are diverse in the various religions and cultures of their people and are bound by kuhap (legal and criminal laws). Thus, ignoring the context of the universality of the traditions will only lead to greater harm, on the contrary by prioritizing moral ideals in the traditions, it will be easily actualized in the contemporary context without colliding with law and culture.

Keywords: Hadith, Amar makruf nahi Munkar, FPI

Abstrak. Tulisan ini menjelaskan tentang konsep yang digagas oleh ormas Front Pembela Islam (FPI) dalam menerapkan amar makruf nahi munkar. Konsep tersebut berlandaskan pada hadis Nabi saw. yang diriwayatkan dari Abu Said al-Khudri tentang langkah-langkah yang ditempuh ketika melihat kemungkaran yang terjadi di masyarakat. Fakta di lapangan menunjukkan bahwa, langkah yang ditempuh oleh FPI ketika memberantas kemungkaran kesannya hanya mengikuti redaksi pertama pada hadis yakni mencegahnya
dengan ‘tangan’ yang seringkali diartikan sebagai tindakan berupa kekerasan. Sehingga tidak jarang ketika melakukan eksekusi di lapangan seringkali menimbulkan konflik yang memicu permusuhan hingga pada benturan dengan hukum pidana. Hal tersebut akibat dari pemahaman secara tekstual dan terkesan parsial dalam memahami hadis amar makruf nahi munkar. Tawaran mamahami ayat secara kontekstual dan meninjau aspek maqasyidnya merupakan suatu keniscayaan ketika ingin menerapkannya dalam ruang sosial Indonesia yang beraneka macam agama dan budaya masyarakatnya serta terikat dengan kuhap (kitab undang-undang hukum dan pidana). Dengan demikian, mengabaikan konteks universalitas hadis justru akan menimbulkan mudarat yang lebih besar, sebaliknya dengan mengutamakan ideal moral pada hadis, akan dengan mudah teraktualisasikan dalam konteks keninian tanpa adanya berbenturan dengan hukum dan budaya.

Kata Kunci: Hadis, Amar makruf nahi Munkar, FPI

Introduction

The increasingly illegible and targeted development of the global world makes various sectors of life tend to lose relevance in universal values. Its influence has an impact on the economic, political, social, legal, orientation as an effort to deconstruct religious values through actions or actions in the field.

The traces can be seen from one of the organizations in Indonesia, the Islamic Defenders Front (FPI). The organization wants the action of amar makruf nahi munkar as the only way to create and achieve obedience in carrying out Islamic law. But if they turn away, then know that Allah is All-Mighty, All-Wise. One of the evidences that is often used as jargon to eradicate evil based on the hadith narrated by Abu Said al-Khudri "Whoever sees evil, change it with his hand. If it can't then with his mouth. If it cannot then with his heart, and that is as weak as faith." (H.R. Muslim).

Understanding the hadith above by the FPI gave birth to the assumption that the act or precaution nahi munkar must be with the "hand" that is the path of
violence. This is what in the implementation in the field is not uncommon to cause a lot of conflict, both in the field of law, social, religious, to cause a prolonged horizontal conflict.

From the general picture above, the author wants to see more about how the discourse amar makruf nahi munkar has become a model of civilization built by FPI as its driving motor to exist. The aspect that the author wants to emphasize is contextualization\(^1\) efforts and building maqasyid\(^2\) values that can be drawn from the hadith about amar makruf nahi munkar, thus giving birth to a universal spirit without causing violence in its application.

**Theoretical Framework**

*Historical Traces Of Ormas FPI*

The choice of the name of the Islamic Defenders Front has its own meaning. The word front, which means "front", indicates that the organization is always trying to be at the forefront and has a firm stance in every step of the struggle. Then the word "defender" hinted that this organization will play an active role in defending and fighting for the rights of Muslims and Muslims. While the word "Islam" characterizes that the struggle of this organization is inseparable from the straight and true ties of Islamic teachings. Under the name "Islamic Defenders Front", this organization will defend "values" and "teachings", Islam is not for the benefit of individuals or certain groups\(^3\). Founded by Muhammad Rizieq Syihab, a name that in a matter of seconds will soon be associated with the Islamic Defenders Front or known as FPI. With regard to its track record, FPI is enshrined by the mass

---


---
media through a series of actions involving the destruction of places that in FPI terms are referred to as "nahi munkar areas", so this organization is often associated with harsh impressions.

According to Thoha Hamim, the emergence of movements affiliated with forms of violence in Indonesia, especially FPI, is influenced by militant movements that occur in the Middle East and other countries. Among others: Jabhat al-Tahrir al-Falastini in Palestine, Palestine Liberation Front (PLF) in Palestine, Moro National Libratiao Front (MNLF) in the Philippines, Ababil Army, and Jundullah Warriors in Jakarta, where the organization moves militantly due to dissatisfaction with the ruling government. As a movement organization, FPI was only officially established on August 17, 1998, but as a forum for clerical cooperation, people in enforcing amr ma’ruf nahy munkar, previously the activists of this movement had carried out various religious activities, such as tablig akbar, audience, friendship with community leaders and government officials and even had held demonstrations.

Therefore, almost all elements of Indonesian society called for political, economic, and legal reforms. FPI also carried the same thing and proclaimed the need for moral reform. As part of the community, FPI feels an obligation to participate in making a positive contribution to the progress of the nation. The socio-political situation behind the establishment of FPI was formulated by activists of this movement as follows: first, the long suffering experienced by Indonesian Muslims as a result of the implementation of human rights carried out by the authorities. Second, there is an obligation for every Muslim to maintain and

---

4 Fikry Muhammadi, Sisi Lain Habib Rizieq, (Cet. II; Jakarta: Zahira, 2017), h. 9
5 Saeful Anwar, Pemikiran dan Gerakan Amar Ma’ruf Nahy Munkar FPI di Indonesia, Teosofi, Vol. 4, Nomor 1, Juni 2014, h. 227.
6 Jamhari dan Jajang Jahroni, Gerakan Salafi Radikal di Indonesia, h. 129-130.
maintain the dignity and dignity of Islam and Muslims. Third, there is an obligation for every Muslim to be able to enforce amr makruh nahi munkar.

This group is called defenders in the hope that it is pro-active in defending the values of truth and justice. It is also expected to be a motivation not to think about what can be obtained, but rather to think about what can be given. In other words FPI should be ready to serve not be served. This kind of attitude is expected to be a waste of courage and encouragement to sacrifice in the FPI struggle.

Concept Of Amr Makruf Nahi Munkar FPI

The use of the sentence amr makruh nahi munkar is very popular in Indonesia. And when Our verses are re cast into the house, they say, "We have no helpers." Amr means to demand the procurement of something, so that his understanding includes orders, orders, appeals, exhortations, exhortations and others who demand the work of something. And allah is All-Knowing, All-Wise.

Those who believe and do good deeds shall have their like, and they shall have no helpers. While nahy means to prevent the procurement of something, so that the understanding includes; prohibit, keep away, avoid, oppose, resist, warning, reprimand, end and others that prevent anything from being done. And Allah is All-Knowing, All-Wise.

The concept of amr makruh nahi munkar is two of the main concepts in the FPI movement. Whatever they do in the form of lectures or street actions, can not be separated from these two concepts. The categories of makruh and munkar deeds that FPI defines, in addition to the fields of religion covering the social, economic, political and cultural fields.

---

7 DPP FPI, Risalah Historis dan Garis Perjuangan FPI, (t.t.: t.p., t.th.), h. 89.
8 Muhammad Rizieq Shihab, Dialog FPI-Amr Ma’ruf Nahi Munkar, (Jakarta: Ibnu Saidah, 2008), h. 35.
Related to evil, the above categories can still be clarified into several larger categories, namely: First, the category of public diseases (sin), among them thuggery, liquor, gambling, prostitution, drugs, pornography, and pornoaksi. Second, the categories of religious irregularities, including religious abuse, shamanic practices, aqidah deviations, apostasy, secularism, pluralism, indifference to religion and Muslims, and rejection of the application of syarî’ah. Third, the categories of injustice and injustice, including the kidnapping of FPI activists and slander. Fourth, the category of non-Islamic system, namely: nation state, socialist/capitalist economy. The above categories are the main discourses that develop in FPI. Therefore, FPI's focus is more on direct action to eradicate sin, because in their minds the category of munkar is much more dominant than makruf, which has a very wide social application, and not personal deeds. Habib Rizieq interprets the verses of amr makruf nahi munkar as the duty of every Muslim. For example in Q.S. Ali Imran: 104.

The translation:

*And let a party of you call to virtue and enhort good and forbid evil, and they are the successful.*

Then how is the implementation of amr makruf nahi munkar FPI in understanding the verse? Reality shows that prostitution locations, gambling and drug centers, nightlife centers, and other crime locations are always heavily guarded by thugs, even predicted by security forces. If the action of amr makruf nahi munkar wants to be applied, then the actions and movements of amr makruf nahi munkar can not be avoided or in other words must use violence. Rizieq also realized that the enforcement of amr makruf nahi munkar could not have been done without the path of violence. The problem of sin in the eyes of the FPI which

---

requires direct action by hand, on the basis of the footing of the shar’î of the Prophet's command that reads.

فقال أبو سعيد أما هذا فقد قضى ما عليه سمعت رسول الله صلى الله عليه وسلم يقول من رأى منكم منكراً فليغيره بيده فإن لم يستطيع فبلسانه ومن لم يستطيع فبقلبه وذلك أضعف الإيمان (رواه مسلم)

Means:

*Whosoever sees evil, change it with his hand. If it can't then with his mouth. If it cannot then with his heart, and that is as weak as faith.* (H.R. Muslim)

The method of amr makruf nahi munkar by hand, if not capable with the mouth, if not capable with the heart. This is the root of anarchism in every FPI action. Referring to the classical Islamic history, that the act of extermination of the location of immorality was also carried out by Ibn Taymiyah with his followers. They destroyed stalls selling liquor, and Ibn Taymiyah's actions were well quoted in an FPI recording.

**FPI Idea Polemic**

Practice in the field shows that the implementation of nahi munkar is certainly a lot of challenges, when viewed from the locations that become the center of evil, that in every location of prostitution, gambling, and nightlife, there is always a strict guard from the syndicate of thugs. The consequence, is that the actions carried out by the FPI often end in conflict with the thugs. For example, when FPI soldiers attacked the unloading ground in Tanah Abang which was used as a prostitution site, what happened was an open conflict between FPI and the thugs,

---

and inevitably many members of the army were battered. FPI's conflict with thugs also occurred when FPI attacked gambling venues in senen area, and attacked the prostitution site in Kali Jodoh. In this incident, several members of the FPI army became victims of thugs' mismatch. In the event of Ketapang FPI warriors joined the Muslim thugs of Ambon, against a gang of thugs from Ambon Christian.

In carrying out actions and actions to enforce amar makruf nahi mungkar, FPI always uses the symbol as a jihad struggle in the way of Allah swt. This spirit of jihad then strengthens them to do actions such as eradicating sin. Some of the actions of amar makruf nahi mungkar performed by FPI in Makassar are:

a. The attack on the Indonesian Ahmadiyya Jamaah (JAI) makassar secretariat. The attack was carried out on the view that Ahmadiyah is heresy. The incident took place on August 14, 2011. The attack led to FPI leader Makassar Abdurrahman being arrested by police for alleged vandalism.\(^{12}\)

b. Raid on food stalls open during the day during Ramadan in Cianjur City, West Java, Wednesday (07/25/2018). In this action, FPI does not see people who do not fast in food stalls.\(^{13}\)

c. Raid liquor factories. FPI also conducted raids on liquor factories such as the PT Padi Mas liquor factory. Several times the liquor factory was raided by the FPI, but then still operated. Therefore, FPI re-to re the factory for the third time on Sunday (07/15/2012). There FPI claimed to be forced to act because makassar city government officials and police seemed to close their eyes to the incident.\(^{14}\)

Various actions carried out by the FPI, the fact that in the field caused many horizontal conflicts, criminal law, and a social climate that is not conducive. For example, when FPI members percussion against the owner of a drug shop in Pondok


Gede, Bekasi City. Police arrested B, a member of the Islamic Defenders Front (FPI). Police confirmed the group had no authority to enforce the law. Even if the public has information related to a criminal act occurring in their environment, it is encouraged to report it to the authorities. Don't even do a vigilante act. The authority of forced efforts such as search, extermination, and seizure is the authority of the police\(^\text{15}\).

In addition, examples of cases that received resistance from the community when the FPI in Nagan Raya Aceh Regency, which carried out raids on cafes and tight clothing, received protests from various parties. According to some reports, FPI raided a number of cafes that are considered to have been used as a place both in the Area of Pantai Wisata Seunangan, Kuala Pesisir District, Saturday, December 22, 2018. In the act they cut off the ends of the pants of three teenagers because they were considered un-Islamic and also forced a number of men to bow their heads to the ground. A resident of Nagan Raya, Susi Riyanti said, the actions taken by FPI members are less civilized. This incident is uncivilized, there are many other ways to advise, not in unethical ways that happen, everyone has wrong too\(^\text{16}\).

The efforts of the application of the form of amar makruf nahi munkar applied by the FPI, apparently gave rise to various aspects, both in the field of religious understanding to the social conlflic aspects of society. What is done by FPI can not be said completely wrong, but it would be good when the action is done without causing a chaos will certainly be achieved the main message contained by the hadith so as not to ignore the context of the content of the Qur'an and other hadiths.


\(^{16}\) https://www.bbc.com/indonesia/indonesia-46671670
Amar Makruf Nahi Munkar Hadith Analysis of Indonesia Legal and Cultural Context

a. Historical Review of Hadith

The context of the hadith discussed speaks of the events that occurred among the companions at the time of the Eid prayer. Then he judged that what Marwan did was not in accordance with existing regulations.

Seeing the incident, Abu Said said: "What this friend did (remind marwan) as decided by the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) and I heard him say: "Whoever sees evil, change it with his hands. If it can't then with his mouth. If it cannot then with his heart, and that is as weak as faith.""

Ashab wurud hadith above shows that the prophet's words explaining the command of amar makruf nahi munkar, although explaining the procedures of taghyir al-munkar (changing evil) ranging from changing it by hand, oral, and heart. But in practice, it doesn't always put the first way first. This certainly becomes clear when viewed from the asbab eurud hadith, where the friend who disagrees with other friends on how to perform the Khutbah Id, does not immediately remind him by doing the first act, namely by hand. But it reminds him verbally. Therefore, the order of procedures that must be used by a person does not have to be forever using the first rank, but the sequences are a choice between the three that correspond to the conditions when evil occurs.

b. Legal Status among Scholars

---

Imam an-Nawawi pointed out that there are not a few evidences of the Qur'an and sunnah and Ijma that show the obligatory amar makruf nahi munkar. Likewise, Ash-Syaukani argues that amar makruf nahi munkar is the main obligation and the greatest pillar in Islamic Shari'a with which islamic rules are perfected with its upright glory. Long before that, al-Ghazali classified the actions of amar makruf nahi munkar into 4 categories. One of them is the lust of al-Ihtisab which is the nature of the form of supervision of acts of evil. Lust al-Ihtisab has several stages, namely indetification, telling, prohibiting, advising, denouncing, changing by hand, threatening with blows, carrying out beatings, threatening with weapons, to the gathering of the masses. These stages can be explained by several points:

1. Identification
2. Informing the perpetrators of evil that what is done is prohibited in religion. This is done without hurting the person who commits an act of evil. Because on the one hand hurting Muslims including acts that are prohibited in religion.
3. Prohibit evil by giving advice and scaring him with the threat of God. This he does is a joke. And those who do evil, and know that it is evil.
4. Denounce with harsh words. This is only done when prohibiting the act of munkar in a subtle way is ignored. Or when the advice given is scorned.
5. Change evil by hand. This has only been done for example by forcing out people who occupy booty houses and others.
6. Take a beating. This can be done in an emergency.

---

18 Yazid bin Abdul Qadir Jawas, *Amar Ma’ruh Nahi Munkar, menurut Ahlussunah Wal Jama’ah*, (Bogor : Pustaka At-Taqwa, 2013), h. 73.
7. Threatening with weapons with the permission of the state leadership. Although these conditions were disputed by the scholars. Muhammad al-Ghazali (Muhammad AL-Ghazali).

The above stages can be abominable reason that, to prevent the evil that is threaded it is not always prevention by hand or violence. If the level is by road violence, it is a very urgent or emergency category. However, when mangabaikan aspects of these stages, it is not impossible that the initial intentions that used to be good actually gave rise to the seeds of division in the community.

c. Practice in the Community

The teachings of good and great religions are not always properly understood by their adherents, so it is not uncommon for them to become something far from what the religion itself wants. The same thing happens in the practice of amar ma'ruf nahi munkar. As we know in society, there are many violent practices committed by individuals or groups against certain people or groups in the name of religion. This action is understood by its adherents as a form of amar makruf nahi munkar, even these ways are believed to be the highest way in the implementation of the teachings of amar makruf.

According to information in the media such as Bernas Jogja newspaper Friday, March 6, 2009 which is the result of an interview with Drs H Bambang Abimanyu, kamtibmas observer and author of the book Bomb Terror in Indonesia and Terror Bomb Azahari-Noordin, it is mentioned that according to the data of The Wahid Institute shows that from January to November 2008, in Indonesia there were 232 cases involving religion. The cases are divided into eight categories, namely misapperation, religious-based violence, religious regulation, conflict of places of worship, freedom of thought and expression, interfaith relations, religious fatwas, and issues of morality and pornography. The most is religious-based violence, which is 55 cases (Bernas: Friday, March 6, 2009).
Long before that, still according to The Wahid Institute, after the 2004 presidential election from March 22, 2004 to February 22, 2006 there have been several incidents of violence on behalf of religion, namely as many as 26 cases spread in several regions and provinces in Indonesia (www.wahid institute.com).

These cases occurred only during the post-2004 presidential election. This is if on average in a month for a year there have been 2 cases in each month. It was also done by several community groups. Meanwhile, according to data revealed by the general daily Jawa Pos Tuesday, dated June 3, 2008 - page 15 revealed that one particular organization (in this case FPI) committed a total of approximately 35 cases of violence (Jawa Pos: Tuesday, June 3, 2008).

However, many other communities also support acts of violence committed by other organizations in the name of religion. Interestingly expressed in this study, an analysis put forward by Jajang Jahroni one of the activists of the Liberal Islamic Network (JIL) which said that indeed not all forms and types of religious violence can be directed at the understanding of textual religion and Islamism. There are still other variables that contribute to the occurrence of religiously violent behavior. But compared to other variables, these two variables are most significant in encouraging the emergence of religious violent behavior. In addition to encouraging religious violent behavior, textualism and Islamism also correlate positively with general violent behavior and state violence (www.islamlib.com).

The statement can be justified, if you see that there are some religious teachings (Islam) that expressly oblige to do amar ma'ruf nahi munkar in various ways, one of which is by "Hands" (as contained in the hadeeth of the history of 6 hadiths other than al-Bukhari) even it is used as an indication of the perfection of one's faith. This understanding is often developed and believed by some Muslims. But it is not the only understanding that exists. Thus, the study and application of
the meaning of religious texts became very important, including the study of hadiths related to amar makruf nahi munkar.

It is important to explain here that changing evil by hand, is not the only way to do amar makruf nahi munkar. In fact it should not be done, when it can cause greater harm. On this basis, al-Ghazali stated that if the perpetrator of evil is a leader, then the method that can change the evil is only by two means of telling and advising. Such are the levels of the attempt to change evil. Although the scholars differed in relation to the levels of amar makruf nahi munkar, but in principle, all agreed, that changing the act of evil must pay attention to the conditions that must be met.

Conclusion

The explanation above gives birth to a conclusion that the hadith about amar makruf nahi munkar which is understood by the FPI as a proof of violence in launching some of its actions tends to ignore the universal dimension of the text. So that what appears on the surface of the hadith accentuates the attitude of violence it contains. In fact, there are more wise stages in running amar makruf nahi munkar in the social level. So the author disagrees when the hadith only makes justification in every action carried out during the raid by the FPI. Is it permissible for you to do so on behalf of the Prophet (peace and blessings of Allaah be upon him) that you should be allowed to do so? It may be that they commit acts of evil by depriving them of their rights as victims as a result of acts of physical and physical violence.

References


DPP FPI, *Risalah Historis dan Garis Perjuangan FPI,* (t.t.: t.p., t.th.).


